

ESRC Teaching and Learning Research Programme: 'Enhanced Competence-Based Learning in Early Professional Development'

Draft paper for publication

Professionalism on probation: induction and new teachers in Scotland Brian Corbin and Ian Stronach

This paper draws on some of the ways teacher 'professionalism' is currently theorised, all reflecting rapid and contentious changes in education. Such changes impact on new teachers and new induction policy in pronounced ways, and so data is used from an ongoing project on 'Early Professional Learning' (EPL), concerning new teachers in their induction year 2004-5.¹ It concludes that new teachers remain primarily mobilised by professional commitments to their own learning and that of their pupils, but these involve both necessary and contingent conflicts, often experienced as 'shared persistent dilemmas' rather than resolved as competences achieved in a one-year timeframe. It is argued that the formal induction arrangements are themselves discursively mixed, that competence is necessary but insufficient framing of professionalism and that competency-led profiling sits uneasily with the more productive possibilities of induction. There is a need to develop a more complex theorising of this process, especially in relation to the professional as person, whose learning is always located in a particular context of practices, relationships and reputations.

Introduction

Context: big bangs, singularities and singulars

At first sight of the transcripts of teacher-research interviews with probationers the metaphor of 'big bang' was suggested, to capture what seemed to come across as an explosion of overwhelming activity when new teachers first encountered their schools. While the cosmological metaphor looked back from the present of an expanding universe to its conjectured beginning as infinitesimally small 'singularity', the transcripts were often witness to a turbulent beginning, with possible professional expansion yet to come. A history of all too frequent initial turbulence was also the warrant for the discourse of the new induction arrangements: its key terms were 'standardisation', 'transition', 'consolidation' and 'extension', with the professional as 'lifelong learner', negotiating change by collaboration, reflection and self-evaluation.

One conceptualisation of such movement has seen new teacher professionalism as contextually formed, and like a cooling and forming from inchoate matter, settling by processes of situated learning:

Specifically, the teachers, especially good ones, drift towards routinization and consistency (Leinhardt 1988: 147)

Though 'drift' seemed rather serene for probationer accounts, signs of settling began to appear. What might enable this process? Bernstein has suggested this as the aim of the first ever curriculum for professionals, starting not as 'singularity' as much as induction into an inner 'singular' of disciplinary knowledge, and crucially, an identity dedicated to it:

it is precisely in this pedagogic sequencing in which inwardness and commitment shaped the terms of practical engagement in the outer world, that we can find the origins of the professions (Bernstein 2000: 85, quoted in Beck and Young 2005: 187)

Such 'practical engagements' can be fraught and just as cosmology itself has become concerned with the turbulence of births, deaths, implosions and explosions, then so with the contested nature of teacher professionalism.

Professionalism as dying can be linked to external and internal sources: externally as the growth of employee status in the private sector, compounded by political interference in the public sector; and internally as epistemological self-doubts about the knowledge base of claims to expertise. Bernstein's metaphor for current professional 'self' was at best to see it embroiled in an "arena", which creates a sense of drama and struggle' (Bernstein and Solomon 1999: 269); at worst it was increasingly being vacuumed altogether of ethical commitment or subject expertise, and instead forever to be responsive to political direction. This is the policy-makers' dream of a 'designer' rather than 'active' professional (Sachs 2001), professionalism ending not as bang but whimper. These discursive framings suggest different possibilities for 'professionalism'.

Epistemological uncertainties

The older epistemological challenge is that induction into to the universe of professionally-based knowledge necessarily meant acknowledging its limits, yet this was also the 'inner' creative spur to new knowledge and a cycle of paradigm deaths and births. However, more recently Schon has proposed a deeper epistemological crisis, namely that such knowledge was framed within a flawed 'positivistic' paradigm unable to account for professional competence (Schon 1983). In response to such implosion, he championed the 'reflective practice to access 'the nonlogical features' of messy, often inexplicit ways professionals make complex and necessarily contextualised judgements.

Such inner uncertainties might be further fuelled from the 'outside', especially in relation to social and economic changes. Relevant here is Evetts's (2005) distinction between two 'ideal types' of professional discourse, the occupational and the organisational. The claims of occupational discourse are largely internally-based on trust, autonomy and collegiality. In organisational discourse such features are weakened, yet though professionals are employees under 'external' managerial control, which attempts also to strengthen itself by invoking professional commitments to individual self-regulation: a Foucauldian governmentality, "as much about what we do to ourselves as what is done to us" (Danaher, Shirato and Webb, quoted in Lather 2004 :21). In the end, 'the "auditors" can be shown to be "us"' (Strathern 2000: 290), with a zombie-like 'singular' neither fully alive nor dead. The consequent discursive tension may even result in paradox : 'do complex systems of accountability and audit themselves damage trust?' (Evetts 2005: 15).

However, Avis's account raises a positive possibility of a renewed basis for trust, given that organisations in competitive markets increasingly demand a creative 'edge' in entrepreneurial risk-taking. This opens ethical as well as epistemic possibilities for an 'expansive professionalism' of collective problem-solving and dialogic 'relationships based on trust' (2003: 320). Hayes's account of the impact of such outer forces in the post-compulsory sector of education is less optimistic. Though it echoes the foregoing economic and epistemological tensions, his is primarily a political concern. It traces Thatcherite policy moves away from professionalism based on the 'first way' (occupational) to the 'second way' of a market-driven (organisational) discourse. However, this shift weakened the collective constituencies for later New Labour appeals for support of its 'third way' collaborative, public-private projects. He argues that this is evident in post-compulsory education as a 'therapeutic turn' focusing on individual subjectivity.

This political expedient has economic ends and reductive epistemic consequences. For those learners still required for low rather than new high skill labour markets, such 'therapy' focuses less on specific job-skills than on raising 'self-esteem'. For those professionals working with such learners, this has 'an epistemological parallel in the shift from (subject) knowledge to (therapeutic) process' (2003: 33). Students feel better about themselves, and teachers feel good about that, but this too much process and not enough of the skill or knowledge content assumed as essential to former notions of professionalism. Reflective practices are reinscribed here as pathologising 'self', sustained by growing counselling, mentoring and guidance industry and distracting from a collaboratively 'expansive' or 'active' professionalism. As the discourse of teacher preparation and induction policy feature 'reflective practice' and 'self evaluation' as essential to professionalism, then how evident is this 'therapeutic turn' in probationer accounts?

Teachers and self-conflicted professionalism

These theorisations suggest that at worst the 'outer has become the inner' (Beck 1999: 228), and at best implicated in particularly nuanced ways. Perhaps the claims of teachers to have ever been fully 'professional' are exaggerated, peaking in post-World War 2 in the UK as a temporary 'liberal humanist settlement' with teachers only 'granted' autonomy in the classroom ... as the curricular and pedagogic experts (Avis 2003: 321, emphasis added). As data from Scottish schools will be used in this paper, it is worth noting that the 2001 policy of the Scottish Executive (referred to as 'McCrone') was a package of measures, one of whose aims was that the 'prevailing culture of hierarchy and compliance (in schools) is to give way to a culture of collegiality' (MacDonald 2004: 414). Here the 'outer' of policy proposes itself as one of 'the origins of the professions' (in Bernstein's phrase). Macdonald notes a teacher resistance to any such change, pointing to the forked tongue of policy and the consequent 'irreconcilable conflict between a discourse of "delivery" and the ideal of collegiality' (ibid 432). Expansion may be illusory, the 'singular' still-born as the general in audit measures 'standardized across a large sample, irrespective of place' (Jeffrey 1999: 56), parodying the 'place' of Leinhard's situated professional learning

Context: the formal induction policy

In Scotland, standardisation of induction provision is the remedy for a 'complex history of neglect', its need clear from McNally's analysis and the McCrone Report's judgement of 'quite inadequate support' for new teachers (McNally 2002: 150). The new 2002 Standard for Full Registration (SFR) offers 'illustrations' of 96 'expected features (competence)', organised into three inter-related categories, the familiar trio of 'knowledge and understanding', 'skills and abilities' and 'values and personal commitment'. In short, professional practice as knowing that, knowing how and knowing why. The arrangements also guaranteed entitlements to include:

- a one-year school placement for continuity
- a designated induction supporter (or mentor)
- CPD (continuing professional development sessions offered by LEA)
- 0.3 protected non-class contact time for CPD
- regular assessed observation sessions, plus opportunities to observe others
- termly reviews informed by the Standards for Full Registration (SFR)
- Interim and Final profiles as evidence for full registration

The SFR is not meant to be seen purely as a management assessment tool, and includes two kinds of process. The first relates to time, emphasising professionalism as 'life-long learning' with the probationary year seen as marking a 'transition' by consolidating, extending or adding to initial competences, though these may require up to five years fully to acquire (GTCS 2002). The second process indicates inner-directed activities, via 'effective self-evaluation' and 'reflective practice'. Rather than 'big bang' this implies controlled expansion and thoughtful engagement with new context, invoking a relational view of probationer not

just as an aggregate of competences, but as person, committed to self-monitoring: for example, as someone 'sensitive to the impact of their personal style of communication on pupils'.²

The SFR is thus discursively mixed, and not one in which 'self-formation contrasts with ... recommended induction policy' (Tickle 2000: 100). Competence as expertise is not inimical to professionalism, but three of its key issues relate to context, values and conflict. We return to these issues in the light of our data on how new teachers talk about their experience of these arrangements. Briefly before then, early concerns and findings from previous research is considered.

Some anticipated issues and early findings about the new induction arrangements

The need for better support for new teachers is generally acknowledged though for different reasons. Policy-makers in both England and Scotland have concerns about teacher retention and quality control, while managers and new teachers welcome support. However, early concerns from the teacher preparation Institutions of Higher Education (IHE) sector in Scotland were that the new policy might be too heavily 'procedure-driven' and insufficiently 'person-centred':

It fits with an education system setting out to provide 'one correct model' (Rippon and Martin 2003: 221)

These concerns echo those identified by researchers involved in the Early Professional Learning (EPL) project, including the emphasis on 'standards-based discourse' at the expense the more 'holistic' practitioner notions, the lack of recognition of informal processes and of the 'radical contextual differences between teaching as a student and as a "real" teacher' (McNally 2002: 159).

These anticipated concerns were themed around too much 'outer' imposition over 'inner' engagements. A similar package of measures, on similar grounds, had already been introduced in England in 1999. Initial studies of newly qualified teachers (NQTs) suggested the Scottish concerns were not unfounded. Some focused on the induction format itself, as likely to encourage an 'instrumental' model of teaching, unresponsive to the 'individual professional needs' of NQTs (Heaney 2001: 253). Others noted its dependence on the right school context, such as an 'institutional ethos' conducive to supportive dialogue (Jones 2002: 523), especially given that 'personal stories and coping strategies' were seen as crucial to a reflective use of the induction model (Harrison 2002). This in turn depended on the 'most highly valued induction activity' of informal discussion (Williams 2003: 212). There were also suggestions that the wider socio-economic and resource challenges faced by schools were the problem, and that too much still depended on 'being in a "good school" or "bad school"' (Jones et al 2002: 507). Similar crucial variability was found by Kyriacou and O'Connor (2003).

Some five years after its inception, a major systematic review of research on its impact in England found little evidence for 'a definitive model of induction' and confirmed the importance of 'local circumstances' and 'flexibility, sensitivity to context and imagination' (Totterdell et al 2004: 38). Overall, while better resourcing and formally raised profile were widely welcomed, induction seemed troublingly caught between the 'outer' of over-prescription and the 'inner' vagaries of collegial and local practices. An earlier study by some members of the EPL team also related to such tension in the professionalism of experienced teachers in how they saw their engagements with new curriculum policy.³ It argued that

the professional self currently mobilises discrepant identities that raise it as a problem for itself (Stronach et al 2002: 2)

The epistemological emphasis was on the movements of a 'discursive dynamics' of the professional as caught between different discourses, and the data resisted a simple morality

tale of (organisational) 'imposed policy as bad' and (occupational) 'collegial practice as good'. Their accounts of 'outer' imposition drew on both 'inner' collegial and personal commitment to pupil learning, yet were also troubled by a performative discourse of learning as audited outcomes. A metaphor was offered for such complications of movement as possibly productive, but more as 'pulse-like' than as implosion or explosion (Stronach et al 2002:131).

Methodology

The methodological focus of this 2002 study was on four ways of complicating the notion of professionalism, and these can be related to new teachers. Though bearing the impact of recent political, social and economic changes, the first also concerns 'irresolvably ambiguous' aspects of teacher role. For example, the relationship between the person and the 'singular' commitments to becoming 'professional: 'what part of myself must I maintain in order to subvert myself? (St. Pierre 1997: 365). Teaching as 'therapy' for 'self esteem' or of skill and knowledge? More traditionally, child or subject? The second way concerns boundaries rather than role, what expands or contracts in the engagements of 'inner' and 'outer' forces, currently discoursed as between restrictively performative or collaboratively 'expansive' professionalism? With new teachers, it might also be asked whether post-McCrone induction policy fuels or depletes professionalism. The third way concerns time, and how narratives of professional self, linking past, present and future, are constructed by teachers 'at the gateway' to the profession. Where there is conflict can 'time turn a paradox into an oscillation' (Strathern 2002:)? Given the various discourses available, the fourth complication considered 'what is possible and not possible to say about contemporary professionalism'.

The present study of early professional learning (EPL) uses data from teachers in their probationary year, engaging with the new induction policy in Scotland. Overall, it is also accepted here that

There is no ... single story of learning to teach. There are, however, some shared persistent dilemmas, contradictory realities and common narratives that the newly arrived personally confront and internalize as their own (Britzman 2003)

Given this, it was thought important to obtain data which would capture something of the individuality and possible commonalities of these stories. The EPL data source in Scotland used six 'teacher-researchers' for interviews and observations. These were located in their own schools in various local education authorities (LEAs). Each worked with three or so probationers seeking full registration in their induction year (2004-5).⁴ The purpose of using 'insider' teacher researchers, familiar with the school and able to arrange frequent meetings, even if occasionally brief and serendipitous, was to access the informal as well as formal aspects of probationer experience.⁵

While still episodic, such regular contact did enable something of a personal narrative to be built up, whose continuities are lost if only ever reported as selected fragments across other narratives for comparison. In the following short case, that kind of contact is used. The analysis draws especially on ways of focusing on the tensions, dilemmas and movements referred to above: of role, boundaries and the importance of time in constructing a sense of professionalism.

Geller (S): professionalism and 'real education' in the 'exam factory'

Geller is a language teacher who, on a pre-probationary short-term supply post, was forewarned that it was likely to be 'a roller coaster' ride. With no full induction support, so it turned out:

When you arrived to take a class for absent teachers you were slow handclapped, booed and hissed. I felt that the pupils did not know me yet (Geller, August)

After such mortifying encounters, his subsequently supported probationary status in his next school revives him. He begins to clarify how he sees the role his in relation to both pupils and another teacher:

I've got a shared S1 class ... the teaching styles are completely different ...but they'll realise when they're in my class they'll do things my way... Some of them said 'but we like you Sir, why can't we have you all the time?' Maybe I'm doing something right after all! (Geller, September)

Later in the same month, he continues to define his professional self against rather than with immediate colleagues, this time the development of his subject expertise denied by being cloned into the curriculum scheme of an unsympathetic Head of Department. He offers a new metaphor:

I feel like I'm in a pool of water and one day I will break the surface and be able to breathe more easily (Geller, September)

After this near-death by drowning, by October, things are improving, but only within the constructed context of the classroom rather than in the school as a whole:

I feel a lot more confident in the classrooms now ... but I feel as if I'm not really been treated as a proper member of staff. I feel like an extra ... just the probationer and I just have my classes to worry about but I would much rather get involved in the school and have a say (Geller, October)

Denied 'expansive' engagement, sidelined as a non-acting 'extra' he continues to question collegial practices, a reminder that tensions are not just between discourses of 'occupational' and organisational 'professionalism'. Later in the same month, induction observations help his personal clarification teacher role:

I saw teachers doing things in different ways. I am quite stern with them... a lot of teachers took a far more light-hearted approach and the kids seem to respond to that ... I come across unprofessionalism every day ... they maybe side with the kids and then the kids look on you as an ogre. When I was at school and you had a strict teacher you did learn from them ... I don't want to be their best friend (Geller, October)

This is a key learning issue for him, though experienced as a role paradox: 'unprofessionalism' works. The problem of what he might become leads him from present to past collegial practices: as a pupil what kind of teaching enabled him to learn? His discourse of professionalism centres on a commitment to learning, and now its paradox becomes a still difficult but workable problem: how to be strict yet neither 'best friend' nor 'ogre'?

Well into his first term, and struggling between remembrance and aspiration, he addresses an SFR competence, that he 'is sensitive to the impact of (his) personal style ...on pupils'. Yet these personal reflections are not just an issue of 'therapeutic process' against subject knowledge, nor is his concern with self at the expense of the wider context:

Most schools are exam factories at the end of the day and interested in statistics. I don't agree with any of that but at the end of the day I will be accountable ... I think for the first time I have seen the negative side of this job (Geller, October)

The future is no longer aspiration but suddenly collapsed into what is nigh, 'the end of the day', and he is already a 'dead man walking', condemned to imminent death by numbers. It is wider dilemma, between his commitment to learning and how he sees accountability. This is the time of his Interim Profile Report and he feels unable to make these doubts transparent to formal process (as he has to the teacher-researcher). He has to keep going, and the LEA promises a job next year 'with the proviso' he gets the school's imprimatur.

Next term, he feels better that he is learning a more inflected professionalism, somewhere between 'ogre' and 'best friend':

Basically if the pupils can, in between direct teaching, ... tell you a joke or tell you something that happened outside school then ... that is a good indicator that they see you as person not just as somebody there to teach them ... I try really hard to be fair and consistent (Geller, January)

What has helped is that he has 'broken away' from his original mentor and, discovering that while collegiality is not universal, he has found some other teachers helpful – and then 'you get a completely different picture'. Two months later, he observes an experienced teacher who combines her personal teaching style which, though not for him, is compatible with his ideals of learning:

In a lot of ways I think you can get away with a lot of things if you have been here for ages ... Yeah, you learn to know when you can let go and just be yourself (Geller, March)

She has achieved the sort of relationship with pupils that his initial encounters denied him ('they don't know me yet'). Time, induction arrangements for observation, and his commitment to his subject, his personal style and his relationship to his pupils, all seem to be gelling more favourably.

In getting to this point he has loosened up his view on ways of being a teacher and seen both possibilities and constraints afforded by collegiality and external pressures:

I feel that in this school ... it is an exam factory. There is no real education going on ... I normally put up a case but I find that I have had to keep my mouth shut this year (Geller, May)

His comments specify 'this school' and 'this year', and he resurrects his aspirations that his professional dilemmas will in future, if not resolve then at least oscillate with a healthier 'pulse':

The values that I had when I became a probationer or even a student are totally changed ... but I have had to change them in order to fit into the curriculum, which is really sad I think and going to be an issue for me (Geller, May).

So he gets on with it, in a way he feels has to be invisible to formal profiling as competence in 'reflection' of 'self-evaluation'. By now, it is decision time. He would feel more 'secure' with a permanent post, and is torn between the uncertainty of moving on, or staying in the 'exam factory', in a polluted context but where at least he is getting 'established', because 'the kids now know me' and he is 'building up a reputation'. He gets through his induction and accepts a post at the school.

The SFR and developing competences: 'reading between the lines'

Geller's story is presented here not as an exemplar case of 'the new teacher and new induction', and even in our data his narrative both shares with and differs from those of the 27 others. For example, he made more consistent use of the SFR standards than most, and seemed more unfortunate in the collegiality he experienced. Yet his 'personal - professional' role dilemma, and the troubled engagement between subject commitment and 'standards discourse' was often shared. The specifics of his school made for a highly textured and shifting context: a staff whose 'morale is rock bottom', capable both of 'unprofessionalism' and as support; pupils who are 'fantastic' but with 'deep rooted problems'; his idealisation of education as learning pitched against 'exam factory' accountability; and an induction process both restrictive (feeling he must 'try to fit into the Standard') as well as potentially expansive, as here in his suggestion for improvement:

I think it would be a good idea if schools used probationers who had just gone through the system to be 'buddies' or mentors for the new intake ... If you always have to go the Faculty Head you begin to feel really incompetent and inadequate whereas ... (ex-probationers) remember what it is like to be new and feel vulnerable (Geller.)

He has not given up on the 'collegial' ideal, and again this is a reminder of the discursive contextuality of 'competence' – experienced as hierarchical or collegial, short-term assessment or more gradual expansion?

Britzman has warned against any tendency to see 'competency as the absence of conflict' (2003: 7), and its possibility is addressed in official induction guidance to schools. For example:

The personal code of practice of the probationer in the classroom should be compatible with that of school/department. It should be established and put into practice from day one (GTCS 2005: 29).

Geller's year long, still unfinished struggle is at odds with discursive tenor here and raises several questions. Its deadline of 'day one' assumes summary resolution rather than issues for reflection. Yet how clear to a new teacher is their own 'personal code of practice'? Or the school's? How long might it take for the two to be made 'compatible'? How would this be displayed in competence discourse – as outward acquiescence? In the case of Geller we see an instance of a new teacher's performative display of 'compatibility', but only by putting his deeply felt commitment 'on hold'. So what is not possible as an issue for professionalism – for example, that some aspect of school practice may be 'professionally' questionable by new teachers?

Further, what is ticked off as an acquired competence in one context may seem quite different in another. The SFR assumption of continuity can be deceptive: for example

Newly qualified teachers will have become accustomed to engaging in self-evaluation within ITE (GTCS 2001)

But in the new context, 'self-evaluation' might only start in a meaningful sense:

I was always bogged down with self-evaluation at Uni ... regurgitating the same old stuff ... Now in my planner I'll have what I'm supposed to be doing next week with the class and then I'll decide I need to change ... I'll write it into that so it's self-evaluating in a very, very informal way (Linda)

There is reluctance here to discourse the developing practice-SFR link as formal learning, and it is less likely to be acknowledged than its imposed assessment significance.

Competence: reflection as therapeutic or expansive?

The format of the Report Profiles seemed to have caused problems in that there was 'nothing that personalised about it' (Linda). Yet this often repeated appeal is not simply as reflective therapy, but can be discoursed as of pedagogic benefits for the learning of others:

It wasn't seeking to find out anything about me personally about my learning styles ... and that's what the whole point of teaching is ... it's about tapping into the learning styles of your pupils (Rachael)

Rachael also thought that probationers might 'share what each other's got on these forms' but their 'ticky box' format prevented 'expansive' use as no specific details could be included. Lewis also links the personal with collegial:

It doesn't tell them very much at all about me as a teacher. I guess that comes from (experienced teachers) in their sections (of the report) (Lewis)

'Person-centred' discourse need not oppose 'expansive' intent. The uneasy discursive relationship with the documentation often contrasted with probationer experiences of the new arrangements as a whole:

It's a great introduction to first time teaching ... time to coordinate and to learn and to bounce ideas off other members of staff (Richard)

Opportunities for learning-focused dialogue as well as stress-releasing therapy of 'letting off steam' with peers were appreciated.

The SRF is intended to inform the processes of reflection and self-evaluation as well as assessment of fitness for full registration. Often there was little continuation of focus or meaning from initial qualification, but in time, a new sense of realism in context emerges:

Certainly what I've put down this time have been things I really wanted to do ... and I do see myself heading towards the guidance side of things... A lot of my action points are specific to that (Avril)

When the competences of the Standard are consulted, there can be specific criticisms. For Ann, not only is there 'too much to get your head around', but taken point by point there is a further problem:

It's impossible to actually look at each point and ... know if you've even completed it. How do you know if you working cooperatively with other professionals and adults? You don't know yourself. Only the people you're working with know (Ann)

She sees the SFR as asking too much as of self-auditing and takes a more collegial view, especially as novice professional. A senior teacher put succinctly what many felt:

The actual Standard) I think is not a user friendly document. I know that mentors toil over just exactly what some parts mean and obviously so do the actual probationers ... reading between the lines and saying "Well I could make that fit." (Audrey, Induction Supporter)

Added to local interpretation, time is also an issue:

I do think what is behind the document is important though ... I don't think you could fulfil all these things in one year as a probationer ... so it shouldn't just stop after you are fully registered (Ann)

It should be noted that this longer term developmental view is exactly how the SFR sees itself, but the new teachers wanted them more clearly differentiated from immediate issues of coping with 'the big bang' of classroom and curriculum issues.)

Professionalism and values

Values are also claimed as being essential to professionalism. In Bernstein's terms, they are the essential to its 'singular'; for Evetts, such commitments are what the 'organizational' discourse covets most from the 'occupational'. They are one of the three key 'competence' categories in the SFR, underpinning practice and the resource for 'self-evaluation', it might be thought to 'hold across contexts' as part of the 'core' of professional self (Gee 2000-1: 111), even if, as with Geller, they can be both a remembered ideal and aspiration, only occasionally realised in the here-and-now.

However, values may not always be self-evident and ready to summon as a basis for action:

My priority in class is just that everyone is participating and doing the best they are capable of. That hasn't changed ... I'm not sure that my values have changed all that much to be honest. I'm not sure what my values are which is one of the difficulties (Lewis)

I still feel my ideas and ideals about being a teacher have stayed the same but they might have changed ... it's something that's difficult because they would be developing gradually so it's hard to think back and think, 'What were my ideas about being a teacher like a year ago?' (Linda)

Becoming a teacher can be an uncertain process though always focused around their own and pupil learning, even if there is a shift in what exactly is to be valued about the supposed purpose of learning and what might sustain a commitment to it:

I increasingly think I'm not just here to teach biology and I would far rather that at the end of the school time the kids were leaving socially competent adults ...that's more important than whether they get a 1 or 5 in their biology (Avril)

Like Geller, Avril is losing interest not her subject as much as what happens to it in the 'delivery' discourse: yet unlike him she begins to shift her core role commitment to what might become compatible with 'therapeutic' subjectivity, though this may also reflect her delight with the collaborative practices of her school community.

Conclusions

Even when arrived at with 'broad approval from all key stakeholders' (GTC 2001), there is a danger that 'competency-led profiles ... re-define the nature of teaching' (Husbands 1993: 115). The issue is how to sustain the acquisition of competences at the same time as embodying their necessary relationship to time, context and conflict in professionalism. There is a risk then that competency-led profiling, for all their intended transparency about judging 'the fitness of new teachers for full registration' (GTC 2002: 2) may also disguise or disregard crucial issues probationers raise in their accounts. Competence statements assume a norm, defined as standards, perhaps needing need contextual modification. Yet where contextual variation is the norm, as in early professional development, then that is why they 'talk so much about professional judgement' (Squires 1999: 20).

Presumably it is intended that what profiled competences dismantle as assessment tool can be reassembled in the processes of reflection and dialogue afforded in the arrangements - and these are valued by the new teachers. Professionalism also entails ethical issues, acknowledged by the SFR in two ways: by statements of 'values' such as the commitments to social justice and taking responsibility for professional learning; and second by reference inner processes to 'self-evaluation' and reflection'. Rightly so, as these are 'an integral part of teaching' (Arthur 2002: 317), but not either as self-evident in themselves nor straightforward in their relationship to everyday practice for probationers. They are always contextually embedded in power relationships. A new teacher who fails to meet the requirements in the stated period does not get to teach in State schools. For those doing the assessments, as well as those being assessed, the induction is a high-inference process with high stakes for school reputations, new teacher careers and the quality of 'professionalism'. In England with a longer- running new process, official data (though incomplete) suggests that deferment is seven times more likely than failure (Totterdell et al 2002: 14). Recruitment and retention are also more difficult in schools in 'challenging' circumstances: the possible link with induction issues is unexplored.

More generally, evidence of different kinds of tension has been offered in the data here, some inevitable and necessarily related to the nature of professional discourse, and the complex process of induction itself. They just have to be worked through and are compatible with SFR discourse of collaborative dialogue, reflective practice and 'life-long learning'. The good news is new teachers are often discourses by more established teachers as learners needing support, and probationers see themselves as such, and that at least there are uncertainties and struggles in 'self-formation' which are seen as extending well beyond the initial year. Less productive have been assumptions of continuity and of a 'standardisation' impervious to contextual uncertainties, collegiality, sympathetic management and compatibility with a 'delivery' discourse. The success of formal arrangements is seen to depend on how they are used and such use cannot be removed either from the pressures schools are under, nor their occupational cultures.

References

- Arthur, J. (2002) Editorial: professional value commitments, *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 51 (4): 317-19.
- Avis, J. (2003) Re-thinking trust in a performative culture: the case of education, *Journal of Educational Policy*, 18 (3): 315-332.
- Beck, J. and Young, M.F.D. (2005) The assault on the professions and the restructuring of academic and professional identities: a Bernsteinian analysis, *British Journal of the Sociology of Education*, 26 (1): 183-197.
- Beck, J. (1999) Makeover or takeover? The strange death of educational autonomy in neo-liberal England, *British Journal of Education*, 20 (2): 223-237.
- Bernstein, B. (1996) *Pedagogy, symbolic control and identity: theory, research, critique*, London, Taylor and Francis.
- Bernstein, B. and Solomon, J. (1999) Pedagogy, identity and the construction of a theory of symbolic control: Basil Bernstein questioned by Joseph Solomon, *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 20 (2): 265-279.
- Britzman, D. P. (2003) *Practice makes practice*, New York, State University of New York Press.
- Evetts, J. (2005) 'The management of professionalism: a contemporary paradox', paper delivered at the *Changing Teacher Roles, Identities and Professionalism Seminar*, King's College, London 19.10.05.
- Gee, J. (2000-2001) Identity as an analytic lens for research in education, *Review of Research in Education*, 10: 99-125.
- General Teaching Council for Scotland (2001) *Standard for Full Registration*, Edinburgh, GTC Scotland.
- Harrison, J.K. (2002) The induction of newly qualified teacher in secondary schools, *Journal of In-Service Education*, 28 (2): 255-275.
- Hayes D. (2003) New Labour, new professionalism, in J. Satterthwaite., E. Atkinson and K. Gale (Eds) *Discourse, power and resistance: challenging the rhetoric of contemporary education*, Stoke on Trent, Trentham
- Heaney, S. (2001) Experience of induction in one education authority, *Mentoring and Tutoring*, 9 (3): 241-254.
- Husbands, C. (1993) Profiling of students teachers: context, ownership and the beginnings of professional learning, in D. Bridges and T. Kerry (Eds) *Developing teachers professionally*, London, Routledge
- Jeffrey, B. (1999) Side-stepping the substantial self: the fragmentation of primary teachers' professionalism through audit accountability, in M. Hammersley (Ed) *Researching school experience*, London, Falmer.
- Jones, C., Bubb S., Totterdell M. and Heilbron R. (2002) Reassessing variability of induction for newly qualified teachers: statutory policy and schools' provision, *Journal of In-Service Education*, 23 (3): 495-508.
- Jones, M (2002) Qualified to become good teachers: a case study of ten newly qualified teachers during their year of induction, *Journal of In-Service Education*, 28 (3): 509-526.
- Kyriacou, C. and O'Connor, A. (2003) Primary newly qualified teachers' experience of the induction year in its first year of implementation in England, *Journal of In-Service Education*, 29 (2): 185-200.
- Lather, P. (2004) this IS your father's paradigm: government intrusion and the case of qualitative research in education, in J. Satterthwaite, E. Atkinson and W. Moore (eds) *The disciplining of education: new languages of power and resistance*, Stoke on Trent, Trentham.
- Leinhardt, G. (1988) Situated knowledge and expertise in teaching, in J. Calderhead (ed.) *Teachers' professional learning*, London, Falmer.
- MacDonald, A. (2004) Collegiate or compliant? Primary teachers in post-MacCrone Scotland, *British Journal of Educational Research*, 30 (3): 413-433.

- McNally, J. (2002) Developments in teacher induction in Scotland and implications for the role of Higher Education, *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 28 (2): 149-164.
- St Pierre, E. A. (1997) Nomadic enquiry in the smooth spaces of the field: a preface, *Qualitative studies in Education*, 10 (1): 365-383.
- Rippon, J. and Martin, M. (2003) Supporting induction: relationships count, *Mentoring and Tutoring*, 11(2): 211-226.
- Sachs, J. (2001) Teacher professional identity: competing discourses, competing outcomes, *Journal of Education Policy*, 16 (2): 149-161.
- Squires, G. (1999) *Teaching as a professional discipline*, London, Falmer.
- Strathern, M. (2002) The tyranny of transparency, *British Journal of Educational Research*,
- Strathern, M., (Ed) (2000) *Audit cultures: anthropological studies in accountability, ethics and the academy*, London, Routledge.
- Stronach, I., Corbin, B., McNamara O., Stark S. and Warne T. (2002) 'Towards an uncertain politics of professionalism: teacher and nurse identities in flux' *Journal of Education Policy*, 17 (1): 109-38.
- Tickle, L. (2000) *Teacher induction: the way ahead*, Buckingham, the Open University Press.
- Totterdell, M., Heilbron, R, Bubb, S. and Jones, C. (2002) *Evaluation of the effectiveness of the statutory arrangements for the induction of newly qualified teachers*, Research Report No. 338, London, DfES.
- Totterdell, M., Woodroffe, L., Bubb, S., and Hanrahan, K. (2004) The impact of NQT induction programmes on the enhancement of teacher expertise, professional development, job satisfaction or retention rates: a systematic review of research on induction. In: *Research Evidence in Education Library*, London, EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education.
- Williams, A. (2003) Informal learning in the workplace: a case study of new teachers, *Educational Studies*, 29 (2/3): 207-219.

¹ The data is from some of that gathered in the initial year of the TLRP project on 'Enhanced Competence-Based Learning in Early Professional Development', 2004-8. It draws on the experiences of 28 new teachers in Scotland ('probationers') in their 2004-5 induction year. The Scottish induction arrangements were first introduced during the academic year 2002-3. The project website is: www.ioe.stir.ac.uk

² For example there are some more 'holistic' statements that while 'new teachers can be pre-occupied with class organisation and management', they may beginning to make 'some contribution to the life of the school as a whole'. Other items relate to traditional classroom roles, such as 'can set and mark homework which is varied in form, with clear purpose in relation to class work' (consolidating and extending). Others indicate an 'expansive' professionalism, for example as a commitment to 'work co-operatively with other professionals' (consolidating). There are also eleven references drawing on a person-centred register in relation to learning. The word 'personal' appears five times, combined with 'development' 'commitment' and 'growth', 'style of communication' in a curricular reference for pupils. The related terms 'self' appears twice (as in 'evaluation and 'reflection') and 'own' four times (as in 'role', 'view', 'experience' and implicitly with 'style').

³ These discourses were referred to as an 'economy of performance' (largely quantitative manifestations of an audit and performance indicators) and various 'ecologies of practice' (professional dispositions and commitments individually and collectively engendered), so bear some resemblance to the discourses of organisational and occupational versions of professionalism, particularly her problematising of the possibility of 'trust' in a discursive context where professionalism is an 'instrument of occupational change and social control in managerial discourse' (2005: 3). However, they were not offered as 'ideal types' but used to sustain analytic interest in professionalism as 'complex and inflected', and how 'professionals do not conduct their practices in "real" so much as they traffic between the twin abstractions of the ideal ... and the unrealized' in their professional talk (Stronach et al 2002: 132).

⁴ These were selected on the view that, as 'insiders' relieved of half their teaching duties and with on-site availability, they would be able to access more of the informal and contextual than outside researchers. Their interviews did not share a common structured schedule, though they did focus on common themes thought to be relevant to new teacher experiences: their views and experiences of settling in, establishing themselves, critical incidents, how they found the documentation and provisions of the new arrangements, relations with pupils and staff both formally and informally and so on. How they analysed their own data will be made available elsewhere, and their involvement in analysis as well as data collection is central to the purpose of the EPL project. The use made of that data in this paper is separate for the moment. However it is influenced by meetings and dialogue with the teacher-researchers over the initial year (2004-5) of team collaboration involving both Stirling and Manchester Metropolitan Universities. Over the four years of the project the processes of working together and separately are themselves being made an object of study.

⁵ The analysis offered in this paper reflects in part the themes as covered by the transcripts (averaging 12 per probationer) over the course of the year. Certain theoretical orientations have already been outlined, and these may differ from those of the teacher-researchers. Given the emphasis in this paper on discursive dynamics and context not all inductees feature, as such data requires at least some verbatim reporting with consequent pressure on space.